



GOMAL UNIVERSITY JOURNAL OF RESEARCH

Gomal University, Dera Ismail Khan, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan

ISSN:1019- 8180 (Print)

ISSN: 2708- 1737 (Online)



Website	www.gujr.com.pk	HEC Recognized	Social Sciences	CrossRef	DOI:10.51380
---------	--	----------------	-----------------	----------	--------------

CONTRIBUTION OF STREET HAWKERS TOWARD ECONOMY AND PROBLEMS FACED BY THEM DURING STREET VENDING

Nazia Dharejo¹, Hakim Ali Mahesar² & Ashique Ali Jhatial³

¹PhD Scholar, Institute of Commerce, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Sindh, Pakistan

²Professor, Institute of Commerce, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Sindh, Pakistan

³Professor, Institute of Commerce, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Sindh, Pakistan

KEYWORDS	ABSTRACT
Street Hawkers, Street Vending, Contribution, Challenges, Sindh Province, Pakistan	The informal economy in Pakistan is a part that has been mostly overlooked by researchers, although it is important part of everyday life in provinces like Sindh, Pakistan. This paper seeks to examine how the street entrepreneurs contribute to the economy of country and what type of challenges they face during street vending. By reviewing the extant literature, it appears that there is an acute shortage of empirical evidence on street hawkers in Pakistan, especially in Sindh province. This paper begins to fill this gap by analyzing hawkers' contributions, and the problems they are facing. The qualitative method was followed in this research, study seeks to determine the contribution of street hawkers as well as the issues that street vendors face during vending or conduct their business. There are many hawkers in the heart province of Sindh, hence the researchers used a convenient sampling method to select 30 respondents for the interview, the thematic analysis method was used to analyze data. The study's findings may have a positive impact on street vendors, and the challenges associated with street vending may be reduced.
Article History Date of Submission: 18-05-2022 Date of Acceptance: 22-09-2022 Date of Publication: 30-09-2022	 2022 Gomal University Journal of Research
Corresponding Author	Nazia Dharejo: naziadharejo@gmail.com
DOI	https://doi.org/10.51380/gujr-38-03-09

INTRODUCTION

In the economy, informal sector is quite important. Hart (1970, 1973), a social anthropologist, was the first to introduce the phrase "informal sector" into theoretical literature in (Third World context). He used the term "informal sector" to describe a segment of the urban workforce that operates outside of traditional labour markets. Hart expanded the definition of informal sector to include practically all types of (small) self-employed people. Informality is a financial task, but there is rising suggestion that the informal economy is often smaller amount of productive, perhaps because of its limited size, its lack of admittance of credit or right to use government approved security infrastructure (Almeida & Bianchini, 1998; Paula & Scheinkman, 2007). Since,

it is likely that informal sector will be overtaken by formal sector, business in informal sector has looked to be an element of economic progress in emerging nations. Informal sector has the potential it creates jobs, builds social capital, stimulates local economies, and provides low-cost goods (Sultana, Rahman & Khanam, 2022). Informal sector is contemplated by many small-scale production and service workout that are independent or family kept used labour intensive and straight onward technology. It is easy to join, depending on indigenous resources and family rights of enterprises or activities operated by owner with little or no employees (Todaro & Smith, 2003).

As a result, the informal sector is a complicated phrase with several characteristics. Informality was linked to a country's economic position. Economic informality is thought to have irritating effects on a country's economic performance by lowering productivity and suffocating formal business growth (Farrell, 2004). Thus, according to Kemal and Mahmood (1998), Pakistan's "informal sector is vast and growing quickly", its potential for producing job opportunities, it should be supported by reducing barriers to entry. Simultaneously, some of informal sectors have thrived solely due to tax loopholes and the disregard for labour restrictions. Similarly, workers in the informal sector are exploited in terms of low salaries and longer hours of work. It also encourages child labour, limiting the country's human capital development. The main constraint is the demand for items produced in the informal sector (pp. 22-23). Most people associate term "informal economy" (IE) with illicit activities like drug trafficking or prostitution, as well as paying bribes and evading taxes. As a result, it's often seen to be something to avoid in the goal of a formal economy (FE). Without more examination, it is possible to assume that IE is stepping stone to formality as economies evolve and regulation improves (Chambwera, et al., 2011).

The small or undefined workplaces, insecure and uncomfortable working conditions, low levels of skills and productivity, low or irregular revenues, long working hours, lack of market information, money earning, training, and technology are all characteristics of labor in informal sector. Workers in the informal economy are not recognized, registered, regulated, or protected by law (Trebilcock, 2005). According to research by Khuong et al., (2021), Pakistan informal economy accounts for half of country's overall GDP. Pakistan's informal sector of economy must be the most essential element of the economy since it offers a source of income, bread and butter, and shelter to the poor, who are often overlooked. The informal sector accounts for over 35 per cent of GDP participation (Butt & Zulfqar, 2021). Workplace rights, child and bonded labor, social protection, long-term employment, working poverty, and gender discrimination are all issues that affect Pakistan's informal sector. Even if the street trading is a common occurrence in the African and the South Asian cities, the term "informal traders" is the political invention. Aside from definitional concerns, the subject of being an active member of the society, that is, common citizens as opposed to conditional citizens, is at stake for street traders (Joshi, 2018).

It was also evident that defining "street trade" and "informal activity" is the huge difficulty, and that proper concepts should be contextualised (Racaud, et al., 2018). Term "hawker" expresses their dissatisfaction with their vulnerable situation. However, the hawkers' informal traders are unquestionably entrepreneurs who contribute to the economic prosperity. Local governments continue to refuse to acknowledge street vending, despite its size and (agreed) importance in decreasing economic and social exclusion (Chen, et al. 2016; Lyons & Snoxell 2005; Skinner

2008). According to [McGee and Yeung, \(1977\)](#) Street vendors have long been an important element of many economies across world; they sell goods and services in public spaces, mainly on streets and pavements, and they play an important role in defining unregulated/informal aspects of emerging economies. According to the IEMS in 2004, hawkers could be referred to as: informal workers, "street vendors," and "street trade" ([Roever, 2016](#)). They play important part in the economic growth and development of the local economies. Public authorities regard street merchants as a nuisance and encroaches on the sidewalks and pavements, and they are unappreciative of the vital services that hawkers brings to the world's people. Vendors on the street offer essential public services to urban population while surviving on their own business, limited resources, and labour. State government and municipal authorities have been asked to provide safety for street sellers so that they may earn living without fear ([Jaishankar & Sujatha, 2016](#)).

Research Gap

Recchi, (2020) says that the several gaps in literature on informal economy, which might serve as the foundation for future comparative research on the subject. Furthermore, despite fact that informal street selling occurs in both developing and developed nations, comparative case studies targeted at analyzing this informal sector in so many diverse contexts from both an institutional and economic perspective are lacking in literature. Terms "street sellers, vendors and hawkers" are often interchanged in this study and have the same meaning. If governments wish to alleviate unemployment and poverty in our nation, they should support people in the informal economy to flourish and succeed. Future relative study, on other hand, may increase empirical understanding of the phenomena. There is relatively little information available on the daily struggles of street vendors, precise effects exclusionary policy initiatives have on their livelihoods, and manner in which street vendors adapt their daily living strategies in response to these approaches. Besides, many case studies present very few formal comparisons on street vendors in several cities and regions ([Roever, 2016](#)). As a result, goal of this study is to evaluate contribution of hawkers towards economy and problems of street vendors in Pakistan Sindh province.

Research Questions

1. What types of services do street vendors provide to people of the society, and how do hawkers contribute to economy of the country?
2. What are the main problems that would be faced by the street vendors during street vending?

LITERATURE REVIEW

According to [Vandenberg and Creation, \(2006\)](#) insufficient finances and financial resources are a cause of concern for many small company owners, particularly in informal sector. The private sector's development is critical to poverty reduction. Along with small businesses, the private sector provides and sustains the employment required for underprivileged people to work and gain enough income to buy goods and services; sometimes, the private sector becomes a part of the informal sector. Among other informal workers in urban environments, the street vendor is weakest and most politically disadvantaged ([Brata, 2010](#)). The term's heterogeneous character makes it hard to draw broad judgments about informal sector, especially worldwide ([Pavlovic, 2016](#)). Currently, informal sector employs over half of the world's workforce, with an estimated 1.8 billion individuals vs 1.2 billion in the formal sector ([ILO, 2018](#)). [Indira, \(2014\)](#) report on

knowing informal workforce's share of non-agricultural jobs, 78 percent in Africa, 57 percent in Latin America, and 45-85 percent in Asia. In this connection, self-employment and temporary (non-permanent) jobs or paid activities are two types of informal activities. Consequently, the self-employment accounts for higher share of informal labor in industrialized nations than paid employment.

Self-employment accounts for 70% of informal employment in Sub-Saharan Africa, 62 percent in North Africa, 60 percent in Latin America, and 59 percent in Asia. Many studies on Pakistan informal sector have been conducted, examining various characteristics of the sector, such as pay rates, labour productivity, capital intensity, skill development, and growth restrictions. The results of most of this research cannot be generalized because they are based on tiny samples in one or two sites (Kemal & Mahmood, 1998). Although the informal sector generates more jobs than the formal sector for any given investment and has a better capital productivity, labour productivity in the informal sector is generally poor, and employees have no protection from employers who, although working long hours, pay pitiful wages. The informal economy has the significant impact on development efforts and has therefore become central issue for economic and social development (Elbahnasawy, 2021). The majority of the world's economy is made up of "subsistence economies," where many "subsistence entrepreneurs" are struggling to make a living, and SMEs which are typically poorly managed, ineffective, undercapitalized and transient enterprises (Eijdenberg et al., 2019; Estevão et al., 2022). The informal economy now employs over half of the world's workforce and up to 90% of workforce in some of poorest developing nations.

In developed countries, the IE is the most common source of income for the poor. However, in developing countries, wealthy urban inhabitants are especially important for individuals living in poor urban and rural regions, as well as women and farmers (Xaba, et al., 2002). The tension between normative methods and complexities of unique and changing Socio-economic political contexts is reproduced by informal economy. Academics insist on the need of placing informal economy definitions in specific contexts, such as the social norms, governmental regulation, and the larger economic environment (Hugon, 2014; Lindell, 2010; Potts, 2008). According to the Khan (2012), that the Pakistan's informal economy, like that of any other developed country, is a complex mix of the social, political, and environmental elements. Since it was freed from the British Raj 64 years ago in 1947 and partitioned after 24 years in 1971, Pakistan's economy has seen both good and bad times. Khan claims that the natural catastrophes, significant expenses (both social and budgetary) connected with being a critical partner in the Afghan war, severe energy shortages, and a general inflationary trend in the country, have all harmed the economy in the recent years. With its labour-intensive reliance and dual links to the formal sector, the country's informal economy is obtaining the mixed blessing at the moment (Butt & Zulfiqar, 2021).

Employees in Pakistan have minimal access to labor, welfare programs, and informal economy is large. The informal sector employs 71.7 percent of persons in significant jobs outside of the agriculture, according to the Labor Force Survey (2017-18), with rural regions (75.6 percent) employing more people than urban areas (68.1 percent). When compared to statistics from the Labor Force Survey (2008-09), the informal sector employs more than 73.3 percent of workers in significant jobs outside of the agriculture. Manufacturing in the wholesale and retail trades, community or social and personal services, building, and transportation are all key informal

economy sectors (Khan & Hussain, 2021). Hasan (2021) says that informal economy employs 72 percent of the entire labour force in Karachi, Pakistan. The topic of street trade is fascinating because it calls into question the measuring standards used to analyze the informal economy and norms in public policy and development. Consequently, this problem highlights how the institutional context inhibits street vendors from obtaining a license, keeping them in informal sector (Racaud, 2018). Also, it's also worth noting that acquiring a license does not guarantee that the authorities will not remove sellers from the streets in the future (Spire & Choplin, 2018).

The informal sector, which is mostly comprised of street selling, is vital to the development of income, employment, and manufacturing in many countries (Recchi, 2020). A street vendor is a person who sells goods to the general public without having a fixed facility from which to do so. A hawker is peddler, trader, retailer, and distributor who takes jewelry to DVDs to showcase them for sale (Bhowmik & Saha, 2013). More popular informal trading sector known as street vending is one of the urban economy's informal sectors. The poor have the most access to these street vendors' operations, and traded items are in high demand by the lower middle class since prices are low and not taxed (Destombes, 2010). They are continually at risk of eviction from sidewalks and crowded markets, because public officials tend not to appreciate role of hawkers, although their businesses play a major role in informal economy, contribute to the vibrancy of cities, and form an obvious part of general economy (Khan & Quaddus, 2020). The term street vendors refer to both stationary and mobile vendors. Street vendors can be stationary in sense that they take up space on sidewalk or in other public or private settings, or mobile in sense that they move around carrying their items on pushcarts, baskets or their heads (Bhowmik & Saha, 2013).

According to Winter (2017), street vendors may be seen meticulously positioning their pushcarts, tables, and loaders around sidewalks and street corners, where they deliver their wares. The informal sector includes the street sellers, maids, roadside and barbers small salons in the city's narrow streets, and is source of work and income for larger portion of society (Butt & Zulfiqar, 2021). Street traders can be seen in public locations across the world, but the overall number of street vendors is notoriously difficult to come by (Roever, 2016). In this linking, in our streets, close to schools, fairs, intersections of roads or train stations, the street hawkers are seen here and everywhere familiar. Street hawkers are found on every corner of the street, selling various items. They don't have any particular place to sell their items. They visit the public areas and sites crowded with people and sell their items in front of the people (Banerjee, 2014). Bhowmik, (2001) further defined that the street hawkers operate vending from different parts of the city. Understandably, most street vendors use near various markets, outside the railway stations, bus terminals, schools, parks, places of worship, hospitals, etc., in the city. The "Street vending" is sometimes used interchangeably with street trade, "hawking," and "peddling," among other terms.

Street vendors are those who work in street vending industry (Hasan & Alam, 2015). For the rural migrants in cities, street hawking is major source of income and street vending markets provide consumer products at reduced costs that are affordable to the urban poor. Despite accounting for a significant portion of economy, urban economists and city planners regard the informal economy as a negative mode of production (Bajwa, 2019). We need correctly planned spaces to boost our economy and an excellent living for the poor. Indeed, numerous locations in Karachi,

and metropolitan regions throughout Pakistan, are recognized in food, goods, celebrations, and other activities that take place there, all of which are inextricably linked to the contributions of the thriving street vending trade (Hasan, 2021). Instead of being dependent workers, street traders are micro-entrepreneurs who employ not only themselves but also others. The money they made through these businesses went directly to their families' health, education, and other necessities (Adhikari, 2011). In this drive, by providing a constant retail outlet for a wide range of the cheap items such as fresh produce, prepared food, school and office supplies, fashion, hardware, and electronics, street vending vitality contributes to country's economy, society, and culture.

Because street vendors offer cheap things in tiny amounts, they provide poor access to goods that would otherwise be unavailable (Chen, 2012). Street merchants pay a sort of rent in the form of daily fees collected in exchange for accessing public space (or bribes asked). Most street vendors are subject to various taxes and levies, with indirect taxes posing the greatest burden. As result, street vendors do not escape business expenditures; rather, they suffer costs that are distinct from those incurred by the off-street businesses (Chen, et al., 2016). When we consider maintaining individual sectors by providing marketplaces for their goods, overall employment given by street selling increases; these sectors employ many people and rely heavily on street vendors to promote their goods. Street sellers serve an important service by helping to keep these enterprises afloat (Bhowmik & Saha, 2013). Street sellers work for about 10 or 5 hours every day. It entails going to wholesale markets for vegetable merchants and then sorting and cleaning produce. During their working hours, sellers face several issues for the general public and police officers. They are exposed to hazardous weather conditions like heat, rain, dust, and lack of storage space (Kiran & Babu, 2019). When street vendors fail to register, they risk incurring additional fees, like having their items seized, which is not risk faced by off-street businesses.

Even street sellers who are registered with the municipal authorities or via their organizations suffer a range of penalties for using public space, and they must pay several taxes, fines, and the levies that support local and national government income (Bromley, 2000). The street vendors suffer a variety of issues, but they strive to address them on their dime, rather than demanding that government provide employment for them or engage in begging, pinching, or extortion. They are working hard to maintain dignity and self-respect (Karthikeyan & Mangaleswaran, 2014). Street hawkers do not have a permanent place for selling their goods and most of the vendors are satisfied with their business because they are satisfied with the products they sell and the area where they sell (Bhowmik, 2000). According to Linares, (2017), having unsafe workplace is a big concern for individuals who operate on streets; frequent difficulties include a lack of storage, theft, and stock damage. Vending on street is deemed unlawful, and merchants are punished as criminals. In this regard, they have a capital shortage and rely on loans from friends, family, and money lenders to keep the firms afloat. Thus, because of the considerable documentation required to obtain loan, even licensed persons seldom contact banks (Banerjee, 2014).

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This research was qualitative. Primary and secondary sources were used to gather necessary data for this study. Secondary data was collected from research papers, books, reports, and local newspapers. However, primary data collected through semi-structured interviews. When

a researcher seeks to explain and describe the nature of an issue so that more research may be done, an exploratory study is used. When the qualities and relationships of the research subject at hand are unknown, this sort of the study is frequently selected (Emory & Cooper, 1991). An exploratory study's main goal is to gather and investigate as much information as possible on a given subject or research challenge. It's a research method for identifying and starting process of characterizing the problem and providing criteria for judging the exploration's success (Yin, 1994).

Data Collection

In-depth interviews with 30 street hawkers were conducted to gather information. The data saturation is used to assess the sample size in qualitative research and convenient sampling method was used for collection. The minimum sample size for first analysis and a maximum number of supplementary interviews were determined before starting the interviews (Mason, 2010). Francis et al. (2010) suggests that at least 10 interviews be used to choose initial analytic sample. Following then, further interviews are conducted until no new topics arise "saturation point" is what this is called. When the researcher hears the same statements again and over in interviews, data satiety has reached. Then it's time to stop gathering data and start analyzing what you've collected (Hill et al., 2014; Middlemiss et al., 2015; Jackson et al., 2015; Legard et al., 2003). As a result, we conducted in-depth interviews with 30 street traders from different regions of Sindh for this study. To obtain sufficient information, the interviews lasted at least 40–60 minutes. The following techniques were used to perform research. Ten interviews were done first, and data were examined parallel, but new patterns developed. Second, 10 additional interviews were done in succession, and data were evaluated simultaneously, yet new themes still appeared. The researcher proceeded to conduct interviews until no new theme arose by the 30 interview, indicating that we had achieved saturation. This corresponded to recommended sample size for qualitative research, that was between 20 and 30 respondents (Creswell & Poth, 2016).

Data Analysis

The data from all the interviews conducted are analyzed using a six steps of thematic analysis process. For this study, data from individual interviews were translated from Urdu and Sindhi to English and transcribed. Thematic analysis was chosen as the best approach for evaluating large qualitative data sets (Lorelli, et al., 2017). Similarly, Braun and Clarke (2006) consider the thematic analysis to be a technique for detecting, evaluating, and reporting data patterns (themes). A theme is anything that reflects some level of the structured response or significance within the data set and captures the further essential notion of the data concerning the research question.

Steps for Conducting Thematic Analysis

To assure the study's reliability, qualitative data analysis utilizing the theme method requires a researcher to go through six important steps (Lorelli, et al., 2017). Step One: Familiarizing with data: This process involved listening to recorded audio from interviews to become acquainted with data. Step Two: Initial code generation: This phase was completed by carefully arranging the data to derive significance in connection to the study topics. Writing memos in the margins of the text studied with a colored pen to suggest probable patterns were part of the coding. Step Three: Theme discovery: Examining the codes, classifying various codes into probable themes, and compiling all pertinent data gathered within the discovered themes were all part of this

stage. Some codes in our study fit together into a single subject, for example, we had multiple codes that linked to the contribution of street entrepreneurs as well as the issues encountered by traders. The researcher grouped them under the heading "Street vendor contributions and challenges encountered by street sellers during street vending." The themes that emerged were descriptive, describing patterns in the data that were important to the research questions. Step Four: Reviewing themes: Basic concepts established in phase three were evaluated, updated, and refined at this stage. I gathered all essential facts for each theme & assessed if it truly supports it.

The researcher was required to examine if the themes made sense, whether the data supported them, and whether there were other themes within the data to make them cohesive and unique from one another. As a result, some themes were reorganized, some were deleted, and others were consolidated under a single overall theme. Step Five: Defining and naming themes: This procedure comprises selecting and refining which topics should be included in final analysis evaluating the essence of each subject. The researcher considered what each topic was about, as well as how the sub-themes interacted with and were linked to the major theme and how the main themes related to one another. The narrative of the challenges faced by street vendors was included to offer a relationship between themes. Step Six: Producing report. This process involved report writing, which highlighted the final theme selection's significance and impact. A clear, concise, coherent, logical, non-repetitive, demonstrated, relevant, and straightforward report was developed with reader's understanding in mind, summarizing each growing subject using an essential data set. Direct quotes from participants, both long and short, were included in final report, along with unique identifier to prove that findings were representative of diverse persons.

FINDINGS OF STUDY

In context, one of participants (Male, Fixed Hawker): "We have to organize and clean market ourselves. Just yesterday, I had to pay 50 rupees as a contribution to help clean the market". One participant Semi-Fixed Vendor: "While girls come back from the office in the dark and wait for the bus, in corner in front of the empty apartment. They can hear the sound (Hoka) of the street vendors honestly, they feel good that people are around them and they are not alone, on roadside we are preparing food for our customers, selling goods, and providing safety". One of Male Mobile Hawker said: "We provide jobs for others as well like porters, security guards, transporter, storage providers, among others, we reduce travel and travel expenses, providing a lot of services to people and sell our goods at a lower rate like this dry fruit plate if you purchase from Mall its price would Rs/=1600, but we sell it in Rs/=400". In this connection, in interview, one participant (Female Hawker) said: "Most people start day with the Chola and puri, which they buy from street vendors early in the morning, which are very yummy and fresh; I see that there are a lot of people around street vendors, people come to purchase Partha, puri, Chola and halwa on routine basis to fulfill their needs. They make small quantities of things and finish quickly, we people avoid frozen food, and these things are not found fresh in big stores or supermarkets".

Street Hawker's Contribution:

Street vending is thought to add greater job opportunities in city. Street vendors offer a wide range of goods and services without obtaining a license, producing receipts, or paying taxes, making them a significant element of urban economy. They operate on city sidewalks, major

roads, and bus terminals where huge people are likely to congregate and some sellers also wander throughout the city (Berhanu, 2021). While delivering personalized attention, many vendors work to keep streets clean and safe for their customers. Street sellers employ porters, security guards, transportation operators, storage suppliers, and other workers (Linares, 2017). The street traders are concentrated in urban areas. Though informal trading sector contributes significantly to job creation and the creation of sustainable livelihoods, its potential is not well recognized and acknowledged at local government levels (Tonya & Kara, 2020). It benefits the national economy by creating employment, acting as a job buffer, and providing convenience to customers (Kusakabe, 2006). Street vendors worldwide have been essential part of the urban economy; they provide most middle and low-income people with various products and services at their doorsteps (Imran, 2020). One of most disadvantaged groups of the urban poor is the street vendor. They play an important role in urban economy, offering essential commodities that are both durable and cost-effective to low and middle-income households at low prices. Street food sales also contribute significantly to the economies of the emerging countries (Das, 2019).

Table 1
EmergEd From Interview Data in Charts

Themes emerged from Interview data					
Theme No 1: Street Hawker's Contribution					
Reduced Data in 1st Step-1 Codes	to 3rd Step-2 Categories	step Step No. 3 Theme	RT Step-4 RT	Explain Data in 5th Step-5	to 6th Step-6 FR
Economic Contribution	Street			Defining And Naming Themes	
Healthy Food	Hawker's			Street Hawker's Contribution:	
Provide Attraction	Contribution			The contribution of street hawkers	
Prepare Small Quantities				to build a work for porters, security	
Create jobs				guards, transport operators, and	
Integral Part				storage providers, among others,	
Exchange of Money				not just for themselves, and to	
Security				retain clients, they offer sanitation	
Quick Services				and safety services at their	
Multiple Benefits				workplaces, keeping the streets	
Supportive Environment				clean and safe (Linares, 2017).	
Variety of Products				Street vendors worldwide have	
Run Trade				been an essential part of the urban	
Service Quality				economy; they provide most middle	
Reduce Poverty				and low-income people with	
Convenient Location				various products and services at	
Timely Reach				their doorsteps (Imran, 2020).	
Low Income					
Reduce travel					
Save time					
Reduce Expense					
New Products Introduces					
Cordial Services					
Reduce Tension					
Bargaining Platforms					
Self-employment					
Informal Activities					
Income generation					

Street Hawk's Contribution

Reviewing Themes in this step

Final Report

Cleaning Venue
Offer Services
Selling Goods
Historical
Built Market
Permit Fees

Table 1 presents a detailed step-by-step analysis procedure of interview dataset. Column one step 1 (Economic Contribution, Healthy Food, Provide Attraction, Prepare Small Quantities, Create jobs, Integral Part, Exchange of Money, Security, Quick Services, Multiple Benefits, Supportive Environment, Sell Variety of Products, Run Trade, Service Quality, Reduce Poverty, Convenient Location, Timely Reachable, Low Income, Reduce travel, Save time, Reduce Expense, New Products Introduces, Cordial Services, Reduce Tension, Bargaining Platforms, Self-employment, Informal sector activities, Income generation, Cleaning Venue, Offer Services, Selling Goods, Built Market, Permit Fees) contains codes developed from transcribed data. As previously stated, codes are the labels or key phrases highlighted as the first stage of a theme analysis. Similarly, column two is the second stage (Street Hawker's Contribution), and a similar category of the coded data has been shown. Likewise, one theme has been built from categories in step three of the column (Street Hawker's Contribution). The Step four involves developing a topic from categories, followed by another phase of reviewing the themes. A brief overview of the codes, categories, and themes appears in column five. In last stage in column six reports the subject is delivered. A more in-depth explanation of the findings will be offered later.

In an interview, one of the participants (Street Vendors): "The brokers inside wholesale market of Sabzi Mandi, who are not giving us vegetables at the prices fixed by government, then how we can sell vegetables on officially designated rates, but the police arrest us only, why you are not selling vegetables on official rate, although we buy at high price, then how can we sell cheap, it is impossible". In the words of one participant (Female, Semi-Fixed Hawker): "In the street vending profession some people come because of their needs and some of them because of their happiness but after we join we face a lot of problems. The biggest problem is that the drinking water is not clear for us, and the toilets that there are not close to the vending venue and we have to go very far leave our carts and go for toilet it is risky for us". Male (Fixed Street Hawker) said: "The local authorities dislike the street vending, as we are criminals and working illegally or as we are invading public space, only we know is how we meet our needs and government should allow us without token fees because we have to pay cart fees then we pay the standing fees how we complete basic needs of family and also save money for next day products". In the words of one participant (Female, Street Vendor): "Harassment is common in street vending profession, but it is not so common in our country, but it is, during vending, we are harassed by the local people and also from local authorities harass us. The voice was also raised, but the government did not take any action. If government takes action on this then maybe it will stop completely".

Challenges Faced by Street Vendors

They work long hours with little opportunity for rest and have limited access to urban amenities. Rain, sweltering heat, and bitter cold exacerbates their problems by causing product damage and needing additional accessories (Widiyastuti, 2013). Uncertainty over site allocation makes

it difficult for street sellers to move their carts from one area to another on damaged roads. Lack of shelter and storage space is additional issue for street vendors (Panwar & Garg, 2015). Street vendors operate in a very dismal and in a state of uncertainty; they have to fight on a daily basis for their survival in urban cities. They do not have a proper workplace and access to facilities such as work for long hours, drinking water, and proper food during work hours, toilets, electricity, etc. They cannot employ someone for the help because of their low earnings; they are helped by their family members (Kumari, 2006). Commodities sold by street vendors are exposed to sun, strong rainfall, and extreme heat or cold. Most people do not have access to shelter, running water, or bathrooms unless they work in markets. All vendors have to pay a fixed daily sum to police or Dalals; yet, they are often abused verbally/even physically (Banerjee, 2014).

Despite the clear gendered implications of crises, response and recovery were ignoring needs of street vendors, and they can bear the harsh comments of consumers. The street vendors face continuous abuse from authorities, and to keep operating their trade, the vendors have to pay a large number of their earnings as bribes (Bhowmik, 2010). Everyday working circumstances and techniques of street vendors are extensively researched in contemporary literature on the issue, appearing in nearly all studies evaluated, both in developing and industrialized nations. In this regard, low wages, no social security or state benefits, long working hours, and hazardous working conditions define the working circumstances of street vendors (Etzold, 2015; Saha, 2009).

Table 3
Emerged From Interview Data in Charts

Themes emerged from Interview data					
Theme No: 6 Challenges Faced By Street Vendors					
Step-1	Step-2	Step-3	Step-4	Step-5	Step-6
Reduced Data in 1st to 3rd step	Categories	Theme	RT	Explain Data in 5th to 6th step	FR
Codes	Basic	Problems		Defining And Naming Themes	
Space				Challenges Faced By Street Vendors:	
Harassment				Access to safe drinking water is a big problem for vendors. When operating outside, street vendors and their items are exposed to direct sunshine, severe storms, and extreme heat or cold. Unless they labor in markets, most workers do not have access to shelter, running water, or restrooms near their place of employment (Linares, 2017).	
Token Fees				All vendors have to pay a fixed daily sum to the police or dalals every day, yet, they are often abused verbally or even physically (Banerjee, 2014).	
Crack Down					
Limited Time					
Toilets					
Clean Water					
Lock Down					
Unhealthy Conditions	Health				
Time Consuming	Issue				
Heavy Loads					
Safety Equipment's					
Improper Regulation					
Unhygienic					
Accidents					
Double Burden					
COVID-19 Effects					
Injury					
Physical or					
Mental Strain					
Harsh Comments	General				

Lack of Capital	Issues
Spoil products	
Unsafe Conditions	
Damage	
Theft	
Lack of Storage	
Spoil Products	
High Risk	
Attention	
No Support	
Less Earn	
Tolerate	
Seize goods	
Defenseless	
Pollution	
Legality	
Competitors	
Fail to Receive Order	
Lack of Assess to Welfare	
Uncertainty at Workplace	
Social Protection	
Social Orientation	
Long Hours of Work	
Daily Vending Activities	
Integrity	
Extortion	
Dependent	
Removals	
Weather Condition	Environm
Strong Sun	ental Issue
Heavy Rains	
Hot Weather	
Extreme Cold	
Low Earing	Financial
Price Inflation	Issues
Financial Literacy	
Capital	
Bank Heisted	
Storage of Money	
Payment Bribes	

Table 2 present a detailed step-by-step analysis of the interview dataset. Column one step 1 (Space, Harassment, Token Fees, Crack Down, Limited Time, Toilets, Clean Water, Lock Down, Unhealthy Conditions, Time Consuming, Heavy Loads, Safety Equipment, Improper Regulation, Unhygienic, Accidents, Double Burden, COVID-19 Effects, Injury, Physical or Mental Strain, Harsh Comments, Lack of Capital, Spoil products, Unsafe Conditions, Damage, Theft, Lack of Storage, Spoil Products, High Risk, Attention, No Support, Less Earn, Tolerate, Seize goods, Defenseless, Pollution, Legality, Competitors, Fail to Receive Order, Lack of Assess to Welfare Services, Uncertainty, Social Protection, Social Orientation, Long Hours of Work, Daily Vending Activities, Integrity, Extortion, Dependability, Removals, Weather Condition, Strong Sun, Heavy Rains, Hot Weather, Extreme Cold, Low Earing, Inflation, Financial Literacy, Capital,

Bank Heisted, Storage of Money, Payment Bribes) contains codes developed from transcribed data. As previously stated, codes are the labels or key phrases highlighted as the first stage of a thematic analysis. Similarly, in column two, a comparable category of the coded data has been shown (Basic Problems, Health Issues, General Issues, Environmental Issues, and Financial Issues). Likewise, in step three of columns (Challenges Faced by Street Vendors), step four involves developing one theme from categories, followed by another phase of reviewing themes. A brief overview of the codes, categories, and themes appears in column five. The final stage in column six is to display theme reports. A more in-depth explanation of findings will be offered later.

DISCUSSION

The research explores the vendor's contribution and issues related to their business based on primary data. The research finds that activities of street vendors create demand for both formal and informal suppliers/sectors to develop their products mainly for the formal businesses and others buy them more from informal businesses, while rest manufacture the goods they sell. Street vending is seen as choice for a poor people, locally and regionally; their legal and social status and market opportunities vary. The street vending-dominated informal sector, which is prevalent in many nations, is essential for generating cash, creating jobs, and boosting output (Recchi, 2020). The biggest problem is that drinking water is not clear for us, and toilets that there are not close to vending venue and we have to go very far leave our carts and go for toilet it is risky for us. Majority of vendors' participants share their views that they provide various jobs for porters, security officers, transport owners, cart pullers, and others, creating increased economic growth sweeping up where goods to sell, they provide timely vegetables and fruit, at doorsteps females easily buy and cook it before children come back from school, they accept future payments from their regular customers, they come in street regularly and become part of family.

Their (Hoka) calls are interesting, the crowd around them when they hear their voice and buy various necessities. It has been found that street vendors do not overcharge customers, provide affordable products to low and high-income people; let clients choose their items; maintain the environment clean to minimize illness transmission and vend in conveniently nearby locations. At the same time, they face various problems daily, like lower efficiency of capital and feel the lack of legal protection. Low pay, the lack of social security, state benefits, lengthy workdays or other and hazardous working conditions are common among street vendors (Eltzon, 2015; Recchi, 2022; Saha, 2009). According to an analysis of the street vendor's difficulties, they face lack access to safe drinking water; washroom facilities and they are affected by the various problems while peddling and suffer from sunburns at work. They hope to improve working conditions to make more money. Most of them work daily, struggle to strike a work-life balance, and are concerned about their future. In this drive, they are unable to spend time with their families, are exhausted or sadness as a result of their jobs, and are occasionally harassed by police, they have never experienced customer neglect, threats, or harassment, and just a handful have been victims.

They believe that women vendors are unsafe at street vending locations. Some people have difficulty paying token fees. The majority of the street sellers and consumers believe that police officers treat them like criminals. The street vending is linked to concerns with the consumer harassment, physical assault, crime, security threats, health issues, and environment in many

developing nations (Brown & Rammidi, 2014; Jimu, 2004; Muiruri, 2010). According to the majority of the street vendors' participants, the government and agencies do not rely much on contribution of hawkers to economic growth. The hawkers and clients are very optimistic about street's sales, but talking alone won't work. As necessary, they need to build a safe, permanent legal atmosphere for us to sell in streets. It was important for us that we are safe and complete any marketplace, toilet, social help, protocol, inspiration, health, and climate. The places open are in the fake position, rather than the markets, like waste fields. There must be a change in realistic measures. Different agencies and organizations, just street vendors, claim to encourage it.

CONCLUSION

Street vending is always welcome for older people, women and children. The street hawkers are increasingly widespread nowadays and may be spotted almost anywhere. They offer vegetables, dresses, shoes, repairing services, furniture, and kitchen appliances and variety of other items. Street vendors are providing services and offering goods to the general public from a temporary static structure or movable stand rather than the permanent facility (or head-load). Vending is becoming a key source of income for a huge number of urban poor people because it takes a little training and little money. The street sellers have no social protection, and their working circumstances on the streets put them in danger. The commodities sold by street hawkers are far less expensive than those sold in the main market. In particular, the researcher examines current problems related to the delivery of goods, their challenges, token fees, space, drinking water, toilet, culture, population, municipal authorities, and competitive consideration of the demand for street vendors during transactions. Majority of street vendors in Sindh province, Pakistan, engage in daily commercial operations for more than 8 hours, hawkers are jumbled, the majority of them appear to be concerned about their families and survivors, they are unable to spend much time with family and friends. With their hard work, they can earn enough to cover their daily necessities, on the other hand may get started with very little money. They are occasionally harassed by police officials. The government and agencies are not focusing much on the hawker's contribution to economic development, and no one is looking out for their best interests, after this study, hawkers may be center of attraction. Study results show that street vendors make a valuable contribution to the economy of the country but even they face various challenges.

Recommendations

1. The government should improve the conditions of the vending venue by including all facilities like space, washrooms, water facilities, and protection.
2. Arrange vending awareness programs in cities and make welfare organizations inspire vendors and help street vendors in the uncertainty.
3. With the Government's consultation, welfare organizations must modify vending venues. It must be modified, especially in the Sindh province of Pakistan. So, it can be used for various activities and multi-service.
4. Clear various concerns and myths regarding street vending. Provide them awareness through informative training programmers of personal health, techniques, and skills of businesses, benefits of vending.
5. Develop financial strategies to improve street vending in Sindh, Pakistan.

6. Provide street sellers with skill-based training in areas such as positive attitude, communication, time controlling, self-security, the capacity to accept and learn from both good and negative experiences, social skills, and so on.
7. The authorities should arrange specific medical camps/clinics to manage their occupational ailments in terms of health and sanitary conditions (physical, mental and emotional health).

REFERENCES

- Adhikari, D. B. (2011). Income generation informal sector: A case study of the street vendors of Kathmandu Metropolitan City. *Economic Journal of Development Issues*, 1-14.
- Almeida, R., & Bianchini, Z. (1998). Aspectos de amostragem da pesquisa de economia informal urbana. *Texto para Discussão*, (89), 459-493.
- Bajwa, M. U. (2019). Urban economy and street vendors. <https://dailytimes.com.pk/484491/urban-economy-and-street-vendors>.
- Banerjee, S. (2014). A study of socio-economic condition of the vegetable street vendors in Ranchi. *Jharkhand Journal of Social Development*, 7(1), 1-9.
- Berhanu, E. (2021). Street vending: means of livelihood for the urban poor and challenge for the city administration in Ethiopia. *Journal of Public Administration, Finance and Law*, 10(19), 101-120.
- Bhowmik, S. (2010). The Legal protection for street vendors. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 12-15.
- Bhowmik, S. K. (2000). Street vendors in Asia: Survey of research. In *Street vendors in the global urban economy* (pp. 42-67). Routledge India.
- Bhowmik, S. K. (2001). Hawkers and the urban informal sector: A study of street vending in seven cities. Prepared for the National Alliance of Street Vendors in India (NASVI).
- Bhowmik, S. K., & Saha, D. (2013). Financial Inclusion of the Marginalised. *Finance. Incl. Marg.*
- Brata, A. G. (2010). Vulnerability of urban informal sector: Street vendors in Yogyakarta, Indonesia. *Theoretical and empirical research in urban management*, 5(5 (14), 47-58.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology*, 3(2), 77-101.
- Bromley, R (2000), "Street Vending & Public Policy: A Global Review", *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*. 20, 1/2, 1-28.
- Brown, B. A., & Rammidi, G. (2014). Manifestations of service culture among street vendors in Botswana. *International Journal of Business and Management*, 9(9), 244.
- Chambwera, M., Macgregor, J., & Baker, A. (2011). The informal economy: A primer for development professionals on the importance of the informal economy in developing countries. International Institute for Environment and Development, International Institute for Environment and Development, ISBN: 978-1-84369-822-7 Product code: 15515 IIED.
- Chen, M. A. (2012). The informal economy: Definitions, theories and policies (Vol. 1, No. 26, pp. 90141-4). WIEGO Working Paper.
- Chen, M., Roeber, S., & Skinner, C. (2016). Urban livelihoods: reframing theory and policy. *Environment and Urbanization*, 28(2), 331-342.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2016). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Sage publications.

- Das, S. (2019). A Study On The Business Practices Of Street Food Vendors In Guwahati City. *International Journal of Recent Trends in Business and Tourism (IJRTBT)*, 3(3), 91-98.
- De Paula, A., & Scheinkman, J. A. (2007). The informal sector.
- Destombes, T. J. J. (2010). Informal Entrepreneurs: Street Vendors, their Livelihoods and the influence of Social Capital. The case of cut-flower and fruit vendors in Old Downtown Cebu City, 2007 (Master's thesis).
- Eijdenberg, E. L., Sabokwigina, D., & Masurel, E. (2019). Performance and environmental sustainability orientations in informal economy of least developed country. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behavior & Research*. 18 (10), 566-576.
- Elbahnasawy, N. G. (2021). Can e-government limit the scope of the informal economy? *World Development*, 139, 105341.
- Emory, C. W., & Cooper, D. R. (1991). *Business Research Methods*. Homewood, Ill.: Richard D. Irwin.
- Estevão, J., Lopes, J. D., & Penela, D. (2022). The importance of the business environment for the informal economy: Evidence from Doing Business ranking. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 174, 121288.
- Etzold, B. (2015). Selling in insecurity, living with violence. Street vending in the neoliberal city: A Global Perspective on the Practices and Policies of a Marginalized Economy, New York: Berghahn Books.
- Etzold, B. (2015). Selling in insecurity—Living with violence. Street Vending In The Neoliberal City: A Global Perspective on the Practices and Policies of a Marginalized Economy, New York: Berghahn Books.
- Farrell, D. (2004), “The hidden dangers of the informal economy”, *McKinsey Quarterly*, 2004 (3), 26-37
- Francis, J. J., Johnston, M., Robertson, C., Glidewell, L., Eccles, M. P., & Grimshaw, J. M. (2010). What is adequate sample size? Operationalizing data saturation for theory-based interview studies. *Psychology and health*, 25(10), 1229-1245.
- Hanewald, E. (2015). Motivation Of Street Entrepreneurs. A Multiple Case Study in Shenzhen, China. Hasan, A. (2021, January 3). Karachi Street Economy. Dawn News Paper.
- Hasan, M., & Alam, J. (2015). Street garment vendors' contribution to the economy and local community: Empirical study to street vendors in Dhaka City, Bangladesh. *International Journal of Management and Business Research*, 5(2), 129-139.
- Hill, C. L., Baird, W. O., & Walters, S. J. (2014). Quality of life in children and adolescents with Osteogenesis Imperfecta: a qualitative interview based study. *Health and quality of life outcomes*, 12(1), 1-9.
- Hugon, P. (2014). The informal petite production marchande revisités quarantines après. *Mondes en développement*, (2), 17-30.
- Imran, M. (2020). Opportunities in street vending to help govt address jobs creation issues.
- Indira, D. (2014). A study on the organizing street hawking business. *International Journal of Management and Commerce Innovations*, 2(1), 280-288.
- International Labor Organization. (2018). More than 60 per cent of the world's employed populations are in the informal economy. *International Labor Organization*.
- Jackson, M., Harrison, P., Swinburn, B., & Lawrence, M. (2015). Using a qualitative vignette to explore a complex public health issue. *Qualitative health research*, 25(10), 1395-1409.
- Jaishankar, V., & Sujatha, L. (2016). A study of problems faced by the street vendors in Tiruchirappalli city. *SSRG International Journal of Economics and Management Studies*, 3(9), 40-43.

- Jimu, I. (2004). An exploration of street vending's contribution towards Botswana's vision of prosperity for all by 2016. *Pula: Botswana Journal of African Studies*, 18(1): 19-30.
- Joshi, K. (2018). 'Conditional' Citizens? Hawkers in Streets (and the Courts) of Contemporary India. *Articular-Journal of Urban Research*, (17-18).
- Karthikeyan, R., & Mangaleswaran, R. (2014). Study of socio-economic conditions and working patterns of street vendors in Tiruchirappalli city, Tamil Nadu, India. *International Journal of Physical and Social Sciences*, 4(9).
- Kemal, A. R., & Mahmood, Z. (1998). The urban informal sector of Pakistan: Some stylized facts (No. 1998: 161). Lahore: *Pakistan Institute of Development Economics*.
- Khan, E. A., & Quaddus, M. (2020). E-rickshaws on urban streets: sustainability issues and policies. *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*. 22(02).
- Khan, F. K. (2012). A Study of the informal economy in Pakistan (Doctoral dissertation, KDI School).
- Khan, M. A., & Hussain, B. (2021). Measurement and Determinants of Informal Employment: Evidence from Pakistan. *Pakistan Social Sciences*, 5, 3, 309-324.
- Khuong, N. V., Shabbir, M. S., Sial, M. S., & Khanh, T. H. T. (2021). Does informal economy impede economic growth? Evidence from an emerging economy. *Journal of Sustainable Finance & Investment*, 11(2), 103-122.
- Kiran, P. N., & Babu, G. N. P. V. (2019). Problems and prospects of street vendors: a study concerning Visakhapatnam city. *International Journal of Management, Technology and Engineering*, 9(6), 2249-7455.
- Kumari, P. (2006). Livelihood Pattern and Working Condition of Street Vendors in Delhi. *SSRN Electronic Journal*. 18(4).
- Kusakabe, K. (2006). Policy issues of street vending: An overview of studies in Thailand, Cambodia and Mongolia).
- Legard, R., Keegan, J., & Ward, K. (2003). Qualitative research practice: a guide for social science students and researchers In: Ritchie J, Lewis J, eds.
- Linares, L. A. (2017). Statistics on street vendors and market traders in metropolitan Lima and urban Peru. *WIEGO Statistical Brief*, 16.
- Lindell, I. (2010). Changing landscapes of collective organizing in informal economy. Africa's informal workers: *Collective agency, alliances, and transnational organizing*, 4-34.
- Lorelli, N. S., Norris, J. M., White, D. E., & Moules, N. J. (2017). Thematic analysis: Striving to meet the trustworthiness criteria. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 16, 1-13.
- Lyons, M., & Snoxell, S. (2005). Creating urban social capital: some evidence for informal traders in Nairobi. *Urban Studies*, 42(7), 1077-1097.
- Mason, M. (2010). Sample size and saturation in PhD studies using qualitative interviews. *In Forum Qualitative Sozialforschung/Forum: qualitative social research*, 11, 3.
- McGee, T. G., & Yeung (1977). Hawkers in South-East Asian Cities: Planning for the Bazaar Economy, Ottawa, and IDRC.
- Middlemiss, T., Lloyd-Williams, M., Laird, B. J., & Fallon, M. T. (2015). Symptom control trials in patients with advanced cancer: a qualitative study. *Journal of pain and symptom management*, 50(5), 642-649.
- Muiruri, P. (2010). Women street vendors in Nairobi, Kenya: A situational and policy analysis within a human rights framework. African Books Collective.
- Panwar, A. M., & Garg, V. (2015). Issues and challenges faced by vendors on urban streets: A case of Sonipat city India. *International Journal of Engineering Technology, Management, and Applied Science*, 3, 1-12.

- Pavlovic, I. (2016). The exclusion of informal Micro enterprises from the policies of Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) in Rwanda and Senegal and the factors that contribute to the exclusion (Master's thesis, University of Twente).
- Potts, D. (2008). The urban informal sector in sub-Saharan Africa: from bad to good (and back again?). *Development Southern Africa*, 25(2), 151-167.
- Racaud, S. (2018). Ambiguous resource: "informal" street trading in Kisumu, Kenya. *Articulo-Journal of Urban Research*, (17-18).
- Racaud, S., Kago, J., & Owuor, S. (2018). Introduction: contested Street: Informal street vending and its contradictions. *Articulo-Journal of Urban Research*, (17-18).
- Recchi, S. (2020). Informal street vending: a comparative literature review. *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*.
- Renugadevi, S., Revathy, M., Kalaiselvi, P., & Raja, A. (2022). A Study On Survival Of Street Vendors During Covid-19 Pandemic With the Special Reference To Coimbatore City. *International Journal of Mechanical Engineering*, 1670-1677.
- Roever, S. (2016). Informal trade meets informal governance: Street vendors and legal reform in India, South Africa, and Peru. *Cityscape*, 18(1), 27-46.
- Roever, B. S., & Skinner, C. C. (2016). The Street vendors and cities. *Environment and Urbanization*, 28(2), 359-374.
- Saha, D. (2009). Decent work for the street vendors in Mumbai, India a distant vision. *Journal of Workplace Rights*, 14(2).
- Skinner, C. (2008). Street trade in Africa: A review. School of Development Studies, University of KwaZulu-Natal.
- Spire, A., & Choplin, A. (2018). Street vendors facing urban beautification in Accra (Ghana): eviction, relocation and formalization. *Articulo-Journal of Urban Research*, (17-18).
- Sultana, N., Rahman, M. M., & Khanam, R. (2022). Effect of the informal sector on sustainable development: Evidence from developing countries. *Business Strategy & Development*.
- Todaro, M. P., & Smith, S. C. (2003). *Economic Development 8th Ed India*.
- Tonya, E. & Kara, N. H. (2020). The Contribution of Hawkers towards Economic Development in Developing Countries. Project: Contribution of hawkers in economic development.
- Trebilcock, A. (2005). Decent work and the informal economy (No. 2005/04). Vandenberg, P., & Creation, J. (2006). Poverty reduction through small enterprises. *Seed working paper*, 75, 1-60.
- Widiyastuti, D. (2013). Transformation of Public Space: Social and Spatial Changes A Case Study of Yogyakarta Special Province, Indonesia. Dortmund: University ätsbibliothek Dortmund.
- Winter, B. C. (2017). Appropriating Public Space in Nanchang, China: A Study of Informal Street Vendors. University of South Florida.
- Xaba, J., Horn, P., Motala, S. 2002. The informal sector in sub-Saharan Africa. Employment sector 2002/10 Working Paper on the Informal Economy: Employment sector, International Labor Office: Geneva.
- Yin, R. K. (1994). *Case study research: Design and methods*, 2nd Ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Zulfiqar, F., & Butt, F. K. (2021). Street Vending and Survival of the Underprivileged. *Pakistan Institute of Development Economics*.